

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN**

Fond Du Lac Bumper Exchange, Inc., on  
behalf of itself and others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Jui Li Enterprise Company, Ltd., et al.,

Defendants.

CASE NO. 2:09-CV-00852-LA

Vehimax International, LLC, on behalf of  
itself and others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Jui Li Enterprise Company, Ltd., et al.,

Defendants.

CASE NO. 2:10-CV-00224-LA

**DEFENDANTS' JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS FOR  
FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM UPON WHICH RELIEF CAN BE GRANTED  
AND MOTION FOR JUDGMENT ON THE PLEADINGS**

Defendants Auto Parts Industrial, Ltd., TYG Products, LP, Cornerstone Auto Parts, LLC, Gordon Auto Body Parts, and TKY Industrial Co. Ltd. (collectively, the "Defendants"), by and through their respective attorneys, move to dismiss First Amended Complaint ("FAC") of Fond Du Lac Bumper Exchange, Inc. and Vehimax International, LLC (collectively, "Plaintiffs"), pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) and 12(c). In support of the foregoing motion, Defendants state as follows:

1. The allegations in the First Amended Complaint fail adequately to set forth direct evidence of the alleged conspiracy, allegedly in violation of Section 1 of the Sherman Act, 15

U.S.C. §1, as required by Rules 8 and 12 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and the standards set forth by the United States Supreme Court in *Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly*, 550 U.S. 544 (2007), and *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 129 S. Ct. 1937 (2009).

2. Plaintiffs have also failed to plead facts sufficient to permit the Court to infer the existence of a conspiracy in violation of Section 1.

3. Plaintiffs' claims based upon sales prior to September 3, 2005 are barred by the applicable statute of limitations, 15 U.S.C. §15b.

WHEREFORE, Defendants respectfully request:

A. That the Court dismiss the First Amended Complaint in its entirety, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) and 12(c); and

B. In the alternative, to the extent that the Court does not dismiss the First Amended Complaint in its entirety, that the Court dismiss all claims based on sales prior to September 3, 2005.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Defendants have also submitted a Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Subject Matter Jurisdiction, pursuant to the Foreign Trade Antitrust Improvements Act (the "FTAIA"), 15 U.S.C. § 6a. This filing order was necessitated by Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(g)(2). Defendants submit, however, that the Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Subject Matter Jurisdiction should be decided first, as it raises a fundamental threshold issue regarding the Court's subject matter jurisdiction. Should the Court agree that Plaintiffs have not satisfied their burden of establishing subject matter jurisdiction, the Court need not consider this Motion, which demonstrates that the First Amended Complaint fails to state an antitrust claim. Courts have generally considered challenges to subject matter jurisdiction, pursuant to the FTAIA, prior to considering the merits of antitrust claims. See, e.g., *Animal Science Products, Inc. v. China National Metals & Minerals Import and Export Corporation*, 2010 WL 1324918, at \*33 (D.N.J. April 1, 2010) (*Animal Science II*) (Exh. G to Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Subject Matter Jurisdiction) ("[T]he Sherman Act test would be addressed only if subject matter jurisdiction over this matter is established.").

Respectfully submitted,

Date: May 11, 2010

By: s/ Howard B. Iwrey  
Howard B. Iwrey (MI P39635)  
DYKEMA GOSSETT PLLC  
Suite 300  
39577 Woodward Avenue  
Bloomfield Hills, Michigan 48304  
Telephone: 248-203-0526  
Facsimile: 248-203-0763  
Email: hiwrey@dykema.com  
Attorneys for Auto Parts Industrial, Ltd. and  
Cornerstone Auto Parts, LLC

By: s/Mark A. Cameli  
Mark A. Cameli (Bar No. 1012040)  
Joseph W. Voiland (Bar No. 1041512)  
Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren s.c.  
1000 North Water Street, Suite 1700  
Milwaukee, WI 53202  
Phone: 414-298-8155  
Fax: 414-298-8097  
Email: mcameli@reinhartlaw.com  
Attorneys for Taiwan Kai Yih Industrial Co.  
Ltd. and TYG Products, L.P.

By: s/ Robert M. Kalec  
Robert M. Kalec  
Dean & Fulkerson, P.C.  
801 W. Big Beaver Rd, Ste 500  
Troy, Michigan 48084  
Phone: 248-362-1300  
Fax: 248-362-1358  
Email: rkalec@dflaw.com  
Attorneys for Taiwan Kai Yih Industrial Co. Ltd.  
and TYG Products, L.P.

By: s/J. Ric Gass  
J. Ric Gass (Bar No. 1011998)  
Gass Weber Mullins LLC  
309 N Water Steet, Suite 700  
Milwaukee, WI 53202-5769  
Phone: 414-224-7697  
Fax: 414-224-6116  
Email: gass@gasswebermullins.com

By: s/ Timothy L. Skelton  
Timothy L. Skelton  
Ropers Majeski Kohn & Bentley PC  
515 South Flower Street, Suite 1100  
Los Angeles • CA 90071-2213  
Phone: 213-312-2000  
Fax: 213-312-2001  
Email: tskelton@rmkb.com  
Attorney for Gordon Auto Body Parts

Todd A. Roberts  
Ropers Majeski Kohn & Bentley PC  
1001 Marshall Street, Suite 300  
Redwood City • CA 94063-2052  
Phone: 650-364-8200  
Fax: 650-780-1701  
Email: troberts@rmkb.com  
Attorney for Gordon Auto Body Parts

\